



## Capital Scheme Business Case

### Princess Pier - Superstructure

|                          |                   |
|--------------------------|-------------------|
| Version:                 | 1                 |
| Date:                    | 28.7.17           |
| Author:                  | Kate Spencer      |
| Director/Executive Head: | Kevin Mowat       |
| Project Manager:         | tbc               |
| Business Unit/Service:   | Business Services |

## **1. Executive Summary**

The inclusion of £1.4 million for the repair of the superstructure of Princess Pier, Torquay within the Council's Capital Plan was originally agreed in February 2011 with an additional £450,000 funding being approved at a later date. At that stage, it was expected that the works to the superstructure would be carried out after the sub-structure repairs were completed. Those repairs were substantially completed in February 2017.

In February 2015, a separate allocation of £254,000 was agreed for the replacement decking and joists of the Pier. Following the receipt of tenders, the cost of this work increased to £360,000 with the difference being funded from the allocation for the Princess Pier Superstructure scheme. The work for the replacement decking and joists was completed in February 2017 and the Pier is now considered safe for public use although the banjo area remains fenced off.

The works to the superstructure (namely, repairs to the steel structure and boardwalk not already repaired, demolition of the unsafe banjo "wings" and creation of a ramp to the concrete section of the pier) have yet to be started. There is currently £1.7 million within the agreed Capital Plan for this scheme.

The Council, at its meeting held on 25 February 2017, approved the Capital Plan subject to the Mayor and Chief Executive reviewing this project and making recommendations to the Council. At that stage, it was also agreed that no further significant work should be undertaken until the scheme had been re-presented to Council for detailed consideration and determination as appropriate. This business case sets out the information requested by Council.

## **2. Strategic Fit**

### **2.1 Scheme objective**

The objective of the scheme is to repair part of the superstructure of Princess Pier, Torquay, remove the unsafe elements of the Pier and create a Disability Discrimination Act compliant ramp to enable access to the concrete section of the Pier. Further details of the proposed scheme are set out in Appendix 1 to this Business Case.

This would reduce the level of maintenance required moving forward, protect an important and notable asset for use by residents and tourists in the future and ensure that those with disabilities can enjoy improved access to the entire length of the Pier.

## **2.2 Statutory Framework**

There is no statutory requirement for the Council to own or operate a promenade pier. However, given that the pier is accessed by members of the public there is a requirement to ensure that it is safe and that reasonable adjustments are made to ensure that it is accessible.

## **2.3 Policy Framework**

Princess Pier forms an extension to the promenade at Torquay seafront and, as such, is an important part of the seaside offer. It is one element of Torbay being an attractive place to live, visit and work, one of the actions which fits with the Council's ambitions of having a Prosperous and Healthy Torbay.

## **2.4 Equality, Diversity and Deprivation**

The concrete arm of the Pier is currently accessed via steps. This proposal would see the creation of a Disability Discrimination Act compliant ramp from the wooden element of the Pier down to the concrete arm.

## **2.5 Condition of the asset**

The "wings" of the banjo section have been fenced off since November 2006 as they are deemed unsafe for public access. The old Western Lady timber landing jetty is underneath/adjacent to one of these wings and has been declared derelict. Should the landing jetty fail, this could have implications for this wing of the pier.

The latest Condition Survey for Princess Pier (November 2011) highlighted:

*"The Banjo section of the pier is in poor condition and is continuing to deteriorate. Work will be necessary on this section in the immediate future.*

*In the long term Torbay Council will need to decide what are the future requirements for the Banjo section of the pier. It is very unlikely that it would be economic to repair the Banjo section so demolishing it would be the best option."*

Appendix 1 to this Business Case sets out in more detail the current condition of Princess Pier.

The demolition of the wings of the banjo section would, however, enable the improvement of the Pier through the creation of the ramp to the concrete section of the Pier

## **2.7 Interfaces and Critical Dependencies**

Further works have been identified as being required to the sub-structure of the Pier but these are not substantial and do not put at risk any investment in the

infrastructure above. Progress on the sub-structure works will be dependent on Environment Agency funding, which has been quite reliable over a number of years. Ongoing maintenance will be required for the promenade element of the Pier (the timber & steel superstructure) but the proposal would see that maintenance liability reduce as the quantum of infrastructure is reduced through demolition.

## 2.8 Critical Success Factors

The project will be a success if the access to all sections of the Pier can be improved for all the community, if the works are completed without major disruption and if the works are completed within budget.

## 3. Options Appraisal

| Options considered   | Brief explanation of options (including justifying options exclusion where applicable)  |
|--|---|
| Do nothing   | The Council could continue to operate the Pier as it stands. However, the condition of the Pier will continue to deteriorate which is likely to lead to higher costs for repairs to the superstructure or to the eventual closure of the Pier or parts thereof.   |
| Close the Pier to the public   | If the works are not progressed, ultimately the Pier will need to be closed to the public as it will be deemed unsafe. The Pier is a significant landmark in Torquay and closing it would have a negative effect on the area's and the Council's reputation. Such a closure would also have a negative economic impact.   |
| Demolish the banjo section of the Pier without introducing a new ramp access | This option would address the safety issues with the banjo but it would mean that there would be no improvement to public access to the concrete section of the Pier. However, the majority of the costs for this scheme do not relate to the creation of the proposed ramp.  |
| Demolish the banjo section of the Pier and construct a new ramp access       | This is the preferred option. This option will significantly reduce the level of maintenance required moving forward as some parts of the infrastructure, which are no longer required, will be removed. It will also protect an important and notable asset for use by residents and tourists in the future, as well as ensuring that those with disabilities can safely access the entire length of the Pier. |

## 4. Financial Aspects

### 4.1 Financial Investment

|                            | Year 1     | Year 2 | Year 3 | Year 4 | Year 5 |
|----------------------------|------------|--------|--------|--------|--------|
| Total Capital Investment   | £1,744,000 |        |        |        |        |
| Made up of:                |            |        |        |        |        |
| External Grant Funding     |            |        |        |        |        |
| Capital Receipt            | £279,000*  |        |        |        |        |
| Allocated Capital Grant    |            |        |        |        |        |
| Unringfenced Capital Grant | £1,465,000 |        |        |        |        |
| Prudential Borrowing       |            |        |        |        |        |
| Ongoing Revenue Costs:     |            |        |        |        |        |
| Repairs and Maintenance    |            |        |        |        |        |
| Staffing                   |            |        |        |        |        |
| Other                      |            |        |        |        |        |

\* to be realised from future sales

### 4.2 Financial Savings

|  | Year 1 | Year 2 | Year 3 | Year 4 | Year 5 |
|--|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|
| Savings against current costs            |        |        |        |        |        |
| Additional income                        |        |        |        |        |        |
| Foregone income                          |        |        |        |        |        |
| Efficiency savings – Council             |        |        |        |        |        |
| Efficiency savings – Other public sector |        |        |        |        |        |

There are no cashable savings however the work will reduce future capital liabilities.

## 5. Outcomes, Benefits and Dis-benefits

Princess Pier is part of the Torquay's "shop-window" and is used by tourists, visitors and residents alike. The proposed scheme would ensure that the Pier is accessible to all to continue to enjoy into the future. Although the banjo element will be removed the majority of this area has been closed to the public for over 10 years with no discernible dis-benefit to the community.

## 6. Risk Summary

### 6.1 Risk of not implementing the scheme

| Risk Description   | Risk Mitigation                    |
|--|------------------------------------|
| The Pier (or sections of it) will need to be closed to the public. | Completion of the proposed scheme. |

### 6.2 Risk of delivering the scheme

| Risk Description                              | Risk Mitigation                      |
|---|--------------------------------------|
| The scheme costs exceed the available budget. | The project will be managed closely. |

### 6.3 Strategic Risk Register

To be reviewed if the scheme progresses.

## 7. Project Delivery

### 7.1 Project Roles

The **Project Sponsor** will be Kevin Mowat, Executive Head – Business Services.

The **Project Manager** will be allocated by the Torbay Development Agency.

### 7.2 Milestones

| Milestone                           | Date                 | Dependency/Interface |
|-------------------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|
| Council decision whether to proceed | 13 September<br>2017 |                      |

This section will be completed if the scheme is agreed.